

(2020) 10 AFT CK 0051

In the Armed Forces Tribunal

Case No : Original Application No. 1045 Of 2018

Balwan Singh

APPELLANT

Vs

Union Of India And Others

RESPONDENT

Date of Decision : 14-10-2020

Acts Referred:

Army Act, 1950 — Section 3(vi)

Army Rules, 1954 — Rule 187(1)(r)

Pension Regulations For The Army, 1961 — Regulation 125

Citation : (2020) 10 AFT CK 0051

Hon'ble Judges : Rajendra Menon, J; Philip Campose, Member (A)

Bench : Division Bench

Advocate : V.S. Kadian, Jyotsna Kaushik

Final Decision : Allowed

Judgement

1. The challenge in this O.A is against Annexure A1 letter, whereby the respondents have rejected the request of the applicant for grant of second

service pension for the service rendered by him in Defence Security Corps (DSC) on the ground of not having completed the mandatory qualifying

service of 15 years to make him eligible for the second service pension.

2. It is the conceded position that the applicant had rendered 14 years and 16 days of service in DSC and there is a shortfall of 11 months and 14 days

against the mandatory 15 years of qualifying service, which made him ineligible for the second service pension for the service rendered with DSC.

3. We have heard the learned counsel for the parties and perused the documents available on record.

4. The question involved in this case is no longer res Integra, as the same had already been settled by this Tribunal in the cases of Bhani Devi v. Union

of India and others (O.A. No. 60 of 2013 decided on 07.11.2013), Ex Nk Vijay Singh v. Union of India and others (O.A No. 272 of 2018 decided on

14.10.2020) and the Kochi Bench of this Tribunal in Ex Nk Mohanan T v. Union of India and others (O.A No. 131 of 2017 decided on 12.10.2017). In

Bhani Devi (supra), it was held that the provisions for condonation of shortfall in service under Regulation 125 of the Pension Regulations for the

Army 1961 (Part I) are equally applicable to Armed Forces personnel serving in DSC making them eligible for grant of second service pension.

Against the order in Ex Nk Mohanan T. (supra) granting condonation of shortfall of DSC service, subsequent to issue of GoI (MoD) letter dated

20.06.2017, the respondents had approached the Hon'ble Supreme Court by filing Civil Appeal (Diary) No. 27100 of 2018, which was dismissed vide

order dated 27.08.2018 and thus the matter has attained finality. In Ex Nk Vijay Singh (supra), while referring to the Full Bench decision of this

Tribunal in Smt Shama Kaur v. Union of India and others (O.A No. 1238 of 2016 decided on 01.10.2019), which dealt with the question whether there

should be condonation of deficiency of service for grant of second pension of DSC like Regular Army personnel in terms of Government of India

(Ministry of Defence) letter dated 14.08.2001 and Para 44 of the Army Pension Regulations or be dealt with in terms of Government of India

(Ministry of Defence) letter dated 20.06.2017, this Tribunal quoted Para 44 of judgment dated 01.10.2019 in Shama Kaur (supra), which reads as

under:

(a) The aspect has been discussed in full detail in our discussion above on merits. It needs no further emphasis that the DSC is a part of the

Army and is also treated as a ""Corps"" under Rule 187(1)(r) of the Army Rules, 1954, read with Section 3(v) of the Army Act, 1950. Further

the same pensionary provisions as applicable to the three defence services are applicable to the DSC and all such personnel taken together

are referred as ""Armed Forces Personnel"" as becomes clear from the opening paragraphs of Letter No. 1(5)87/D (Pension/Services) dated

30.10.1987, Letter No. 1(6)980(Pension/Services) dated 03.02.1998, Letter No. 17(4) 2008(2)/D(Pen/Pol) dated 12.11.2008 and Para 3.1

of Letter No. 17(02)/2016-D(Pen/Pol) dated 04.09.2017 issued by the Ministry of Defence after the 5th, 6th and 7th Central Pay

Commissions respectively.

(b) The matter has already been decided by Constitutional Courts and this Tribunal and implemented by the Respondents, especially in the

decision of the Hon 'Ole Punjab & Haryana High Court in Union of India v. LNK DSC Mani Ram (LPA No. 755 of 2010 decided on

05072010), the Hontle Delhi High Court in Ex Sep Madan Singh v. Union of India (W.P (C) No. 9593 of 2003), this Bench in Bhani Devi V

Union of India and others PA No. 60 of 2013 decided on 07.11.2013) and the Kochi Bench in Mohanan T v. Union of India (O.A No. 131 of

2017 decided on 12.10.2017). The letters purportedly amending the relevant provisions have also been held contrary to law vide the above.

In light of this, coupled with the merits of the matter discussed in the instant judgement, there can be no scope of any doubt that DSC

personnel are fully entitled to condonation of deficiency of service for their second spell of service at par with other Army personnel. In

fact, as discussed in the main body of this judgement, DSC personnel re enrolling themselves by opting not to count their past military

service have no connection at all with their past service as far as pension is concerned and their service in DSC is fresh service delinked

from their past service.

(c) Further, the Respondents have themselves stated before the Hontle Supreme Court in Chattar Pal (supra) that condonation upto one

year is possible, and once Constitutional Courts, including the highest Court of the land, have upheld the proposition, it is beyond the scope

of any bench of this tribunal to hold or comment otherwise. We hence answer this question in the above terms.

Â 5. Taking into account the aforesaid factual and legal aspects, we are of the considered view that the facts of this case are also squarely covered

by the decisions in Bhani Devi and Smt. Shama Kaur (supra) and, therefore, the shortfall of 11 months and 14 days to complete 15 years of qualifying

service in DSC by the applicant to get second service pension is condoned.

6. The instant O.A is, therefore, allowed with the following directions:

(1) The shortfall of 11 months and 14 days of qualifying service for second service pension is condoned;

(ii) Subject to verification of records, the respondents are directed to issue a

corrigendum PPO to the applicant granting second service pension for the service rendered by him in DSC, from the date of his discharge; and

(iii) The arrears shall be paid within four months from the date of receipt of a copy of this order. In default, the applicant will be entitled to interest @

6% per annum till payment.

7. There will be no order as to costs.